City of Glasgow College

Board of Management
Audit & Assurance Committee

Date of Meeting	**Tuesday 3 September 2024**
Paper No.	**AAC1-H**
Agenda Item	**5.4.2**
Subject of Paper	**Internal Audit Report – Cleaning Management**
FOISA Status	**Disclosable**
Primary Contact	**Henderson Loggie**
Date of production	**August 2024**
Action	**For Discussion and Decision**

1. **Recommendations**

    The Committee is asked to consider and discuss the report and the
    management responses to the internal audit recommendations.

2.   **Purpose of report**

The purpose of this review is to provide management and the Audit and Assurance Committee with assurance on key controls relating to the curriculum and financial plans in place for City of Glasgow College and their alignment with the regional plan for Glasgow and the college student number targets.

3.   **Key Insights**

This internal audit of Cleaning Management provides an outline of the objectives, scope, findings and graded recommendations as appropriate, together with management responses. This constitutes an action plan for improvement.

The Report includes a number of audit findings which are assessed and graded to denote the overall level of assurance that can be taken from the Report. The gradings are defined as follows:

Good	System meets control objectives.
Satisfactory	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.
Requires improvement	System has weaknesses that could prevent it achieving control objectives.
Unacceptable	System cannot meet control objectives.

4.   **Impact and implications**

Refer to internal audit report.

Appendix – Internal Audit Report – Cleaning Management

City of Glasgow College

Cleaning Management

Internal Audit report No: 2024/10

Draft issued: 6 August 2024

Final issued: 22 August 2024

Henderson Loggie

Level of Assurance

In addition to the grading of individual recommendations in the action plan, audit findings are assessed and graded on an overall basis to denote the level of assurance that can be taken from the report. Risk and materiality levels are considered in the assessment and grading process as well as the general quality of the procedures in place.

Gradings are defined as follows:

Good	System meets control objectives.
Satisfactory	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.
Requires improvement	System has weaknesses that could prevent it achieving control objectives.
Unacceptable	System cannot meet control objectives.

Action Grades

Priority 1	Fundamental issue subjecting the organisations to material risk which requires to be addressed by management and the Audit and Assurance Committee as a matter of urgency.
Priority 2	Issue subjecting the organisations to significant risk, and which should be addressed by management as a priority.
Priority 3	Matters subjecting the organisations to minor risk or which, if addressed, will enhance efficiency and effectiveness.

Management Summary

Overall Level of Assurance

Satisfactory	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.

Risk Assessment

This review focused on the controls in place to mitigate the following risks on the City of Glasgow College ('the College') Strategic Risk Register (as at June 2024):

- SR6 – Negative impact upon the College's reputation (Net Score 9, Medium);
- SR10 – Failure to attract, engage and retain suitable staff (Net Score 16, High); and
- SR26 – Failure to prepare and respond to emerging public health incidents and crises (Net score 10, Medium).

Background

As part of the Internal Audit programme at the College for 2023/24 we carried out a review of the arrangements in place for Cleaning Management. The Audit Needs Assessment, agreed with management and the Audit and Assurance Committee on 2 March 2022, identified this as an area where risk can arise and where Internal Audit can assist in providing assurances to the Principal and the Audit and Assurance Committee that the related control environment is operating effectively, ensuring risk is maintained at an acceptable level.

Oversight of the College's in-house cleaning service sits with the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support, who manages the Facilities and Estates functions within the College. Operational oversight of the cleaning service sits with the College's Head of Facilities, who is responsible for the Cleaning, Catering and Front of House teams. The Head of Facilities is supported by the Facilities Manager who manages the Cleaning Supervisors and the wider cleaning staff across both College campuses.

At the time of this review, the College's cleaning service comprised of 64 members of staff, including three Cleaning Team Leaders who manage staff shift patterns, allocate areas of the campuses to the relevant staff on shift, and manage the response to any ad-hoc cleaning requirements. The Cleaning team is responsible for cleaning the communal areas of the College, with scheduled frequencies for floors and surfaces, with these undertaken on a day-to-day basis.

Scope, Objectives and Overall Findings

This study was designed to review the College's in-house Cleaning Service.

The main objective of our audit was to establish whether the College cleaning service offers value for money.

The table below notes the specific objectives for this review and records the results:

Objective	Findings				
		1	**2**	**3**	**Actions already in progress**
The specific objectives of our audit were to establish whether:		**No. of Agreed Actions**			
1. Cleaning standards are being utilised, and the quality of cleaning is monitored and reported regularly.	**Satisfactory**	-	-	1	✓
2. Training opportunities are readily available for cleaning staff.	**Satisfactory**	-	-	1	✓
3. Staff turnover, vacancy and absence rates are being recorded and monitored.	**Good**	-	-	-	✓
4. Service level agreements are in place and are being utilised.	**Satisfactory**	-	-	-	✓
5. Cleaning budgets are closely monitored.	**Good**	-	-	-	
Overall Level of Assurance	**Satisfactory**	-	-	2	
		System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.			

Audit Approach

The Head of Facilities and Facilities Manager, who are involved in the delivery and oversight of the in-house cleaning operations, were interviewed to determine current working practices, and service level agreements, cleaning standards and training records were obtained and reviewed.

Staff turnover, vacancy and absence rates were analysed.

The cleaning budget and monitoring process was reviewed, and costs were analysed against available benchmarks. However, the inclusion of cleaning within the planned preventative maintenance element of the unitary charge for the College makes it extremely difficult to achieve a like-for-like comparison of cleaning costs with other HE/FE institutions. Therefore, the decision has been taken to remove this objective in order to avoid any potentially misleading comparisons being made.

Summary of Main Findings

Strengths
- The College has a Facilities Management team in place to oversee the in-house cleaning service and help ensure a high standard of delivery.
- Cleaning Team Leaders are in place at both College campuses and are responsible for monitoring the quality of work and overall service delivery.
- Cleaning cupboards are in place across all floors in both campuses for ease of access and efficiency purposes.
- The quality of cleaning is assessed regularly through visual inspection by the Cleaning Team Leaders, Facilities Manager and Head of Facilities.
- Weekly meetings are held between the Head of Facilities, the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support and the Head of Estates to discuss topical issues within the College.
- Control of Substances Hazardous to Health (COSHH) training is in place for all staff as part of the induction training.
- COSHH documentation is available for review in the cleaning cupboards across both campuses.
- Quarterly performance reviews are held between Cleaning Team Leaders and the cleaning staff to help ensure continuous improvement.
- Absence and turnover statistics are monitored by the Head of Facilities on a regular basis with Human Resources reporting in place.
- The cleaning budget is set for each year based on the previous year's figures to incorporate average sickness etc. and any ad hoc events such as Open Days / Evenings and Graduations, with this monitored on an ongoing basis throughout the year.
- Monthly budget meetings are held between the Head of Facilities and the College's Finance team to ensure the service is spending in line with management expectations.
- Authorisation of purchases of products and staff overtime go through the Facilities Manager, Head of Facilities and Vice Principal People and Corporate Support to ensure all additional costs are sufficiently approved.

Weaknesses
- There is no formal audit process in place for periodically inspecting and documenting the quality of work undertaken by the cleaning staff across both the College campuses to ensure that it is consistently performed to an adequate standard.
- There are no formal training mechanisms in place for ensuring the cleaning works are undertaken in a consistent manner across the campuses, with reliance placed on the skills held by existing staff to train new starts on-the-job.

Actions already in progress
- The College is in the process of formally documenting its cleaning standards in a Service Level Agreement (SLA). If implemented in its current form, this will include an aim to ensure that uniformed operatives who deliver the services are fully trained to British Institute of Cleaning Science (BICS) guidelines.
- The revised My Personal Development and Review (MyPDR) process due for launch across the College in August 2024 will enhance the development of the cleaning staff within the College.
- The Head of Facilities and Facilities Manager met with the cleaning staff in May 2024 to discuss their roles and identify any ways in which they can help to support the staff to help reduce absence rates and wider staff turnover, with actions raised from this to address the areas of concern.

Acknowledgments

We would like to take this opportunity to thank the staff at City of Glasgow College who helped us during our audit.

Main Findings and Action Plan

Objective 1: Cleaning standards are being utilised and the quality of cleaning is monitored and reported regularly.

The Head of Facilities is line manged by the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support, and oversees Catering, Cleaning, Front of House and Sustainability. The Facilities Manager works under the Head of Facilities and assists them in overseeing the cleaning service. It was noted from discussions that the Head of Facilities has been with the College, overseeing the catering function, since 2016 however they had only been in their current position for two months at the time this review was undertaken. The Facilities Manager had been in their role for three months at the time this review was undertaken.

The Head of Facilities reports to the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support on a weekly basis alongside the Head of Estates, discussing the College's cleaning function and any prevalent issues which are required to be addressed. The Facilities team shares an office space with the Estates team and, as such, any ad hoc issues or concerns regarding the cleanliness of certain areas are often informally raised to be addressed in a timely manner.

At the time of this review, the College had recently put in place a Cleaning Administrator who assists the Head of Facilities and the Facilities Manager in managing the administrative side of the role, to ensure that documentation around purchasing and processing of cleaning products and equipment, monitoring of staff absences and liaising with the College's helpdesk for any queries are sufficiently managed.

The College's cleaning service comprises of 64 members of staff, spread across the two campuses. There are three Cleaning Team Leaders in place, with two of these at the City Campus and the other at the Riverside Campus. It was noted that at the time of this review, the College had undertaken a recruitment exercise for four cleaner roles and a Cleaning Team Leader role, which it had provisionally filled, taking the total number of staff to 69. Each of the teams are split up into their own areas, with the expectation that they should be assigned to a dedicated area every day to ensure ownership of the cleanliness of the area is consistent. However, it was noted from discussions that due to high staff absence rates and significant levels of staff turnover, that cleaning staff are often assigned different areas each day to fulfil the gaps left by staff who are absent.

The Cleaning Team Leaders work from 6am – 2pm every day, with most cleaning staff following the hours of 6am – 9am. There are some cleaning staff who work 6am – 2pm and they capture any ad hoc works or spillages during the working day. There are then backshift staff who work from 1.45pm to 6.45pm, with no Cleaning Team Leader on shift at either campus during this time. All cleaning staff are expected to be at their respective cleaning cupboard (of which there are 40 at City campus and 20 at Riverside campus) for their shift commencing.

Cleaning Management

Objective 1: Cleaning standards are being utilised and the quality of cleaning is monitored and reported regularly (Continued).

The College does not have an up-to-date formal cleaning standards document, but instead has practices which are based on visual inspection of the quality of work undertaken and hands on training to ensure the quality of work undertaken is in line with management expectations. It was noted that during the Covid-19 pandemic the College adopted key measures such as regular sanitation of hard surfaces, however following the removal of pandemic related restrictions, the College reverted to its previous standard practices. As there is no formal document, the practices in place do not align to any external standards, however they are aligned in some degree to British Institute of Cleaning Science (BICS) best practices. The College is in the process of formally documenting its cleaning standards in a Service Level Agreement (SLA) and, as such, an action in progress has been noted.

Observation	Risk	Recommendation	Management Response
Although visual inspections are undertaken, from discussions with management at the College it was established that there is no formal audit process in place for periodically inspecting and documenting the quality of work undertaken by the cleaning staff across both the College campuses to ensure that it is consistently completed to an adequate standard.	There is a risk that any areas of under delivery are not identified and addressed in a timely manner.	**R1 -** It is recommended that the College develops a formal audit process to inspect the quality of work undertaken by cleaning staff, with the findings from these scheduled inspections reported to the Head of Facilities and Facilities Manager for review and actioning where necessary.	A new cleaning structure will be implemented to allow oversight of all cleaning staff. A new cleaning process is being developed to provide a consistent inspection process to check the quality of work being undertaken. **To be actioned by:** Allison Miller, Associate Director - Facilities, Front of House & Reception **No later than:** 28 February 2025

Grade	**3**

Cleaning Management

Objective 2: Training opportunities are readily available for cleaning staff.

The training for staff is undertaken at the point of induction, with an induction pack provided to all incoming staff, with cleaning staff shadowing other employees to learn their tasks on-the-job. This is undertaken for their first week of employment to ensure that they have a sufficient understanding of their responsibilities. Following their week of shadowing, the member of staff whom the new start was shadowing confirms with a Cleaning Team Leader that they are adequately prepared to work autonomously, at which point they are assigned an area and undertake their duties.

Control of Substances Hazardous to Health (COSHH) training is also undertaken for all staff at induction, with the COSHH folders available for reference to all staff via the cleaning cupboards where they are displayed. All staff are placed on a 12-month probationary period, during which time their competency is assessed through quarterly management reviews, including any outstanding training. These reviews are completed on a proforma document by the Cleaning Team Leaders and provided to the Human Resources team for retention as part of the member of staff's records. This proforma acts as a reference document at the point in time of their annual performance review being undertaken.

From discussions with the Head of Facilities, it was noted that staff are not trained to BICS standards however, as previously mentioned, at the time of this review the College was in the process of developing a SLA for the cleaning service, which if implemented in its current form, will include an aim to ensure that uniformed operatives who deliver the services are fully trained to BISC guidelines.

In addition to the required training, the staff are provided with opportunities for training which they would like to undertake to further their skills, this includes non-cleaning training such as IT, Excel specific training, management training etc. Staff can request this via their Cleaning Team Leader to further their personal development within the College.

It was established through discussions with the Head of Facilities, that the revised My Personal Development and Review (MyPDR) process due for launch across the College in August 2024 will enhance the development of the cleaning staff within the College. This includes reflection on the past number of months and objective setting, with these checked up on every three months.

Cleaning Management

Objective 2: Training opportunities are readily available for cleaning staff (Continued).			
Observation	**Risk**	**Recommendation**	**Management Response**
There are no formal training mechanisms in place to ensure that the cleaning undertaken is carried out to a consistent standard across the College campuses, with reliance currently being placed on the knowledge and skills of existing cleaning staff to train new starts on-the-job.	There is a risk that cleaning practices at the College are undertaken in an inconsistent manner as a result of there being no universally applicable training.	**R2 -** It is recommended that the College develops and implements a formal training programme to be completed for any new cleaning staff to ensure that a consistent approach is taken for all staff across all campuses.	A new COSHH training module is currently being developed and will be available on MyDevelopment. The training will be mandatory and completed annually by all cleaning staff. **To be actioned by:** Allison Miller, Associate Director - Facilities, Front of House & Reception **No later than:** 28 February 2025
			Grade — 3

Cleaning Management

Objective 3: Staff turnover, vacancy and absence rates are being recorded and monitored.

Employee Turnover
The Head of Facilities reviews staff turnover on a quarterly basis, with reports run by the Human Resources team detailing the staff retention rates. At the time of this review, the Facilities Management team had recently been allocated a specific Human Resources member of staff to assist and support them in their Human Resources related matters. The Head of Facilities highlighted the need to determine why staff are leaving, as the turnover rates are particularly high when compared with the remainder of the College. It was noted however, that the staff receive the fair living wage and sociable hours, however, the difference in pay rate between cleaner and Cleaning Team Leaders is minimal despite there being a significant gap in responsibilities.

It was noted from discussions with the Head of Facilities, that there is no requirement for outgoing staff to undertake exit interviews to communicate their reasons for leaving their post as a cleaner, however information has been obtained from a portion of recent leavers which has been utilised by management to identify possible improvements. From inspection of the staff turnover data from May 2022 to May 2024, it was noted that in this two-year period there had been 24 new starts and 28 leavers. Based on a desired number of 69 cleaning staff, this represents a 40.6% turnover in two years. From inspection of the cleaning service budget, it was established that there were vacancies within the College's cleaning service, with one Cleaning Team Leader and four cleaner positions available, which had been provisionally filled at the time of this review.

Employee Absence
From discussions with the Head of Facilities, it was identified that the cleaning staff within the College are entitled to six months of full pay when on sick leave, which has historically been found to have been utilised more than in comparable organisations. As such, this results in the staff remaining in the workplace fulfilling an additional workload due to the prohibitive financial cost of bringing in agency staff to undertake this. There is an absence report run by the Human Resources team which the Head of Facilities reviews for its content, with actions raised such as increasing staff support for those undertaking additional work to cover for absent colleagues. It was also noted that the College has considered proposing changes to Cleaning Team Leader shift patterns to ensure cleaning staff have support throughout the working day.

From inspection of the sickness and absence report for the current calendar year (January 2024 to May 2024) obtained, it was noted that for the 64 cleaning staff within the College, the following absence instances have occurred in the year:
- 59 cases of absence across 39 members of staff;
- 27 one-off absences;
- nine cases of employees having two absences;
- two cases of employees having four absences;
- one case of an employee having six absences;
- 12 open absences at the time of the report being run;
- an average of 15.3 days lost per member of staff; and
- c. £54k of lost resources.

Cleaning Management

Objective 3: Staff turnover, vacancy and absence rates are being recorded and monitored (Continued).

From review of this data, it can be determined that in 2024 alone, the College has lost a significant amount of its resources to staff absences. From discussions with the College's Head of Facilities, it was established that they and the Facilities Manager met with the cleaning staff in May 2024 to discuss their roles and identify any ways in which they can help to support the staff to help reduce absence rates and wider staff turnover, with actions raised from this to address the areas of concern.

Cleaning Management

Objective 4: Service level agreements are in place and are being utilised.

As previously noted, it was established that at the time of this review, there are no SLAs in place, however the Facilities Manager has developed a proposed SLA for the cleaning service, and this is due to be reviewed and refined by the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support in the Summer of 2024 prior to submission to the College's Senior Management Team and Board in the Autumn of 2024 for implementation immediately following approval.

From inspection of the draft SLA document, it was established that the following areas are defined:

- Service Description;
- Support Hours;
- Service Standards;
- Expected Standard; and
- Complaints.

The aim of this document is to clearly define the service delivery of the in-house cleaning service, including highlighting the high quality of work expected to be consistently delivered as part of this. Specifically, within the Service Standards section, the frequency of cleans in specific areas across the College campus, with the coverage of each area defined to ensure that this is clearly understood by the cleaning staff.

The areas which are not covered by the in-house cleaning service are highlighted as part of the Expected standard section to ensure that the remit of the service is clear, with the cleaning of these areas either being undertaken by the area owners (such as cleaning of desks) or an external contractor with cleaning undertaken on a programmed basis (such as window cleaning). To help ensure that cleaning is undertaken to a sufficient standard, the SLA also defines the expected standard to be achieved following cleaning. Within this, issues such as dust and debris should not be visible, waste baskets empty, and consumables replenished for use by the staff and students at the College. All these standards can be confirmed through visual inspection and, as such, can be included as part of the audit process once the SLA is in place.

As the College's SLA document was still in draft at the time of this review being undertaken, an action in progress has been noted.

Cleaning Management

Objective 5: Cleaning budgets are closely monitored.

The Head of Facilities has a budget in place covering all areas within Facilities Management, however there is also a dedicated cleaning section within this. The cleaning budget is set for each year based on the previous year's figures to incorporate average sickness etc. and any ad hoc events such as open days / evenings and graduations which require payment of overtime. Overtime is not ordinarily provided otherwise, with all requests being required to go through the Facilities Manager, Head of Facilities and Vice Principal People and Corporate Support. Costs for materials and equipment are split by City Campus and Riverside Campus within the full budget breakdown.

From inspection of the budget document for the year, it was noted that the annual budget for the in-house cleaning service was:

- c. £1,148k in staffing costs including the management staff and the temporary Administrator;
- c. £20k in cleaning equipment;
- c. £63k in cleaning materials; and
- c. £20k in personal hygiene products.

It was noted that this is monitored on an ongoing basis to ensure that the costs are being suitably managed. From discussions it was also established that purchase orders are required to be submitted by the Cleaning Team Leaders for refreshing of any products or equipment, with these processed by the Cleaning Administrator prior to being submitted for approval.

All products at the College are supplied by international hygiene supplier, BUNZL CHS and, as such, cleaning products are regularly ordered, with these being stocked in the cleaning storage cupboards across both the City Campus and the Riverside Campus, with 40 cupboards at City and 20 at Riverside.

As part of the College's financial controls, there is an approval process in place for any purchase orders for cleaning products, meaning all orders are required to be approved by the Facilities Manager and Head of Facilities (and additionally the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support depending on the value of the order) prior to being issued to the supplier. A similar approval hierarchy is also in place for the approval of any staff overtime (with the Vice Principal People and Corporate Support being required to authorise all overtime, regardless of value), which is required for events such as graduations and functions which require cleaning staff out with their standard hours. Monthly budget meetings are also held between the Head of Facilities and the College's Finance team. These measures help the Head of Facilities to monitor and manage their budget and control costs throughout the year.

Henderson Loggie