

# **Board of Management**

## **Meeting of the Board of Management**

MINUTE OF 5<sup>th</sup> MEETING (BoM5) HELD ON WEDNESDAY 19 JUNE 2024 AT 1600 HRS ON CITY CAMPUS, ROOM C.06.106

Present	
Alisdair Barron (Chair)	Stuart Mcdowall
Dave Anderson	Charlie Montgomerie
Nicola Cameron	Stuart Patrick
Roddy Gillespie	Ronnie Quinn
Paul Hillard	Charandeep Singh
Ewart Keep	Leo Subido
Paul Little	Audrey Sullivan
Don MacKeen	Josh Taylor
In attendance	
Claire Carney	Sheila Lodge
Michael Cross	Drew McGowan
Andrew Dickson	Shona Struthers
Roy Gardner	John Gribben
Observers	
Alasdair McDougall	
Apologies	
Douglas Baillie	Shelley Breckenridge
May Miller	Ann Butcher

Item BoM5-1	Apologies for Absence	
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: Chair	Action Requested: Note
Decision		m D Baillie, S Breckenridge, M Miller and A od wishes for both D Baillie and A Butcher.

Item BoM5-2	Declarations of Interest		
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: Chair	Action Requested: Note	
	A Barron reminded members of the importance of declaring connections and interests at the start and during meetings and highlighted that this was a personal responsibility under the Code of Conduct. He drew the Board's attention to the recent communication issued by D McGowan providing advice and sharing the guidance issued by the Standards Commission for Scotland.		
		Little said he had a connection to all matters on the agenda because role as Principal and Chief Executive. He stated that, after applying the	

objective test, he did not believe amounted to an interest as he did not have a personal interest in those matters being discussed or decided upon.

D Mackeen said he had a connection to item 4.4 because he is a member of academic staff and EIS-FELA. He stated that, after applying the objective test, he did not believe he had an interest to declare because he was not personally impacted by voluntary severance.

C Montgomery declared a connection to all items on the agenda. He explained that he did not believe he had an interest to declare as his role as a trade union Board member was to allow for the voice of the trade union to be heard. A Barron reminded C Montgomery of the advice he had been given by himself as Chair and by D McGowan as Standards Officer and asked that, due to C Montgomery being the Convener of the EIS-FELA branch that authored the proposals tabled for discussion, he reconsider his declaration. C Montgomery declined to do so.

D McGowan explained that section 4.4 of the Standards Commission's advice note outlines that members should be clear that they are required to act in the best interests of the College rather than in the interest of one individual constituency from which they have been nominated to the Board. He clarified that members can raise matters from the perspective of their constituency but, as per the Standards Commission advice, they should not promote the interests of, or lobby on behalf of, the constituency when sitting as a member of the Board. He also referred C Montgomery to Section 5.5 of the Code of Conduct and the advice given by correspondence in advance of the meeting.

J Taylor and L Subido both declared connections to items 3.2, 4.4 and 4.5 due to being students and members of staff. However, after applying the objective test, they said they did not believe this was significant enough or directly impacted them to require them to declare an interest.

S Mcdowall declared a connection to all matters on the agenda as he is a member of staff at the College. Prompted by D McGowan, he clarified that this did not amount to a declarable interest as none of the matters pertained to his specific roles at the College, nor did they have a direct personal impact on him.

D Anderson declared a connection to item 6.1.4. After D McGowan reminded D Anderson of the advice given prior to the meeting, D Anderson clarified that he was declaring an interest in this item as he was being recommended for re-appointment to the City of Glasgow International Ltd Board of Directors to serve on behalf of the Board of Management.

Item BoM5-3.1	Minute of the previous Board of Management Meeting held on 27 March 2024	
Paper No: BoM5-A	Lead: Chair	Action Requested: Approve
Decision	Members reviewed the draft minute of the meeting held on 27 March 2024 and, subject to a minor amendment, approved it as an accurate record of the meeting.	

Item BoM5-4.4	Organizational Change Progress Report
	· · ·
Paper No: BoM5-H	Lead: John Gribben & Action Requested: Discussion Sheila Lodge
Discussion	J Gribben introduced the paper, covering five key areas, and said that D Fellows was in attendance to answer any legal queries members had. He also highlighted that EIS-FELA's alternative savings proposals included restructures of the Executive Leadership Team (ELT) and said ELT members were present to provide advice on the paper as a whole and would stay as long as the Board felt it necessary.
	D Mackeen said he found the language used in the paper in response to EIS-FELA's proposals troubling and unconstructive. J Gribben said the paper was not intended to be negative in its tone, apologised for any offence and said staff would reflect on this when preparing future papers. Members discussed the wider need to reset industrial relations, treat each other with mutual respect and serve students and staff effectively.
	A Sullivan and J Taylor expressed concerns regarding the lack of detail and accuracy in the EIS-FELA proposals and noted that similar concerns were raised when proposals were considered by the Board last year. Members discussed the importance of accurate information to inform decision-making and said they would welcome the College's management and trade unions working together on costing proposals.
	C Montgomery said that he was heavily involved in the preparation of EIS-FELA's proposals, acknowledged that they were not perfect and encouraged the Board to consider savings that did not impact the delivery of learning and teaching and, instead, reduced senior staff. A Barron referred to C Montgomery's comment about being heavily involved in EIS-FELA's proposals and invited him to consider declaring an interest in this matter. C Montgomery referred A Barron to his previous remarks and requested that he not be addressed on this issue again.
	Members discussed the need for a complex organisation like the College to have an appropriate level of senior staff and structure to provide effective management and leadership, particularly in the current challenging circumstances. S Mcdowall highlighted that different departments and faculties in the College will value different work and priorities. He emphasised that it was the role of the Board to consider all perspectives and set the strategic direction of the College.
	S Patrick encouraged members to be cognisant of the strategic role of the Board and the operational role of the College's management when discussing these matters. P Little echoed these comments and, referring to a recent part of the discussion, went on to highlight that the College had had to make a reduction in learning and teaching funding once in the last 15 years owing to the unprecedented financial and funding pressures faced.
	J Gribben went on to provide the Board with an update on organisational change and fair work. He outlined the progress against the £1.8 million of required savings to date and confirmed that proposals submitted by EIS-FELA in regard to Special Projects were currently being considered and discussions were ongoing. While it has taken longer than expected to finalise a protocol with the EIS-FELA and the Scottish Trade Union Congress, J Gribben said the College remains committed to the principles of Fair Work and engaging with our trade unions. He also emphasised the

importance of employment relations activity and the facility time available to trade union representatives.

Members went on to discuss the tone of papers prepared by the College's management and EIS-FELA and the importance of resetting industrial relations. C Montgomery expressed his concern about the reference in the paper to an audio recording of an EIS-FELA trade union branch meeting. J Gribben said that this was a recording made by an EIS-FELA member, shared publicly online and discussed with EIS-FELA previously.

P Little reminded members of the Board's discussion in October 2024 concerning pay deductions for lecturers withholding results and that the College plans to deduct 100% of pay from next week. Noting that D Fellows would have to leave shortly, he asked if members would wish to ask questions at this time so that they were assured of the legal basis for undertaking this action. D Fellows outlined her legal advice to the College and there was a discussion on communications, protected characteristics and implementation.

Noting the time, A Barron asked the Board to move to a decision on these matters. Following a discussion, C Montgomery asked members to support a motion for the College to commission an independent organisation to evaluate the cost of the EIS-FELA proposals to allow for further consideration. The motion was defeated, with 2 members for and 13 against. D Anderson asked members to support a motion to acknowledge that there was insufficient information in the EIS-FELA proposals for the Board to decide on them and, instead, that the Board had confidence in the proposals proposed by the College's management. The motion was approved, with 13 members for and 2 members against.

C Montgomery reiterated his earlier concern regarding the recording of trade union meetings and its use by the College. J Gribben restated his earlier remarks and clarified that the College does not endorse the recording of meetings. After a discussion, the Board unanimously agreed to a motion stating its position that no meeting should be recorded without the explicit consent of those present. The Board also agreed to note the update on employment relations activity and facility time.

Before A Barron moved on to the next item, A Sullivan expressed her regret that the Board had spent more than 2 hours on one item which meant that the presentation of City Attributes had to be abandoned. Members agreed that this presentation should be delivered at the Board meeting on 2 October 2024.

Decision

To approve a motion acknowledging that there was insufficient information in the EIS-FELA proposals for the Board to decide on them and, instead, that the Board had confidence in the proposals proposed by the College's management.

To unanimously agree that no meeting should be recorded without the explicit consent of those present.

To note the update on employment relations activity and facility time.

To agree that a presentation on City Attributes be deferred to the Board's meeting on 2 October 2024.

Item BoM5-3.2	Draft Budget 2024-25	
Paper No: BoM5-B	Lead: A Dickson	Action Requested: Approve
Discussion	highlighted that the College is now projected to be £0.5 n that the Finance Committee meeting and was content to A Barron thanked all staff	t budget for the Board's final approval. He had a projected deficit of £1.8 million and this nillion for 2024-25. R Quinn informed the Board reviewed the draft budget at its most recent recommend it to the Board for final approval. involved in improving the College's financial ed the draft budget for 2024-25 as tabled.
Decision	To approve the draft budget	for 2024-25.

Item BoM5-3.3	External Effectiveness Re	eview	
Paper No: BoM5-C	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Approve	
Discussion	undertaken by C Munro or review and approval. He level of good governance recommendations will be in Members discussed the re-	cGowan tabled the final report of the External Effectiveness Review ertaken by C Munro of the College Development Network (CDN) for two and approval. He highlighted that the report recognises the high of good governance demonstrated by the Board and that the minor mmendations will be incorporated into the Board Development Planshers discussed the recommendations and the use of deep dives at the d and in committees. The Board approved the report.	
Decision	To approve the External E	ffectiveness Review 2023-24 Report.	

Item BoM5-3.4	Amendments to Committee To	erms of Reference
Paper No: BoM5-D	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Approve
Discussion	conclusion of Board recruitme amendments to the Terms of F changes. He also requested the committee membership be take Board members to participate for the control of the	undertaken by the committees and the nt and appointments, D McGowan tabled Reference and provided an overview of the nat a decision on further minor changes to en by correspondence to allow new student ally in the first cycle of meetings. The Board anges and agreed to take a further decision
Decision	To approve the amended comm August 2024.	nittee Terms of Reference, effective from 1
	To agree to take a decision before the Board meeting on 2	y correspondence on minor amendments October 2024.

Item BoM5 3.5	<b>Board of Management and Com</b>	mittee Schedule for AY 2024-25
Paper No: BoM5-E	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Approve
Discussion		of Board and committee meetings for the approval. Members were content to
Decision	To approve the schedule of meeti	ngs for 2024-25.

Item BoM5-3.6	Strategic Risk Review	
Paper No: BoM5-F	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Approve
Discussion	D McGowan tabled the outcome of the most recent quarterly review of the Strategic Risk Register and Management Action Plans (MAPs) for the Board's approval. He highlighted the recommended increase to the score of SR9 (Performance) from 10 to 15 and the addition of SR27 (Artificial Intelligence). Members were content to approve.	
Decision	To approve the Strategic Risk Re	egister as tabled.

Harri DaME 4.4	Otrodontal Association Healata	
Item BoM5-4.1	Students' Association Update	
Paper No: BoM5-G	Lead: L Subido & J Taylor	Action Requested: Discuss
Discussion	Association (SA) recently and prog voted on last year, including a Stude and support for neurodivergent studyear, they also highlighted that study opportunities for students within the and international students, the devet the integration of trans inclusion. The new Presidential team. Members con	s of work undertaken by the Students' press made on the priorities students and App, inclusive sports opportunities, dents. Looking to the new academic ents had voted in favour of more paid as SA, expansion of support for ESOL elopment of a community garden and nese priorities will be taken on by the ingratulated L Subido, J Taylor and the the last year and, noting that they will nem success in the future.
Decision	To discuss the report.	

Item BoM5 4.2	Final Chair's Remarks	
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: Chair	Action Requested: Note
Discussion	as Chair and from the Board in Ju College and a legacy institution continue to do extraordinary work amidst unprecedented challenge current industrial relations but re through mutual efforts and respe to work with successive Boards years, as well as work with siste area. He concluded by telling me	e his last meeting before stepping down ally. With nearly 20 years of service to the n, he said the College and the sector and improve the life chances of students is. He also expressed his regret over the mained hopeful for future improvements act. A Barron said it had been a privilege and serve staff and students over the r colleges to serve the Greater Glasgow imbers that he was happy to hand over to not would provide sound leadership to the ademic year.
Decision	To note the report.	

Item BoM5-4.3	Principal's Report	
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: P Little	Action Requested: Discussion
Discussion	P Little advised members that the College continues to achieve success with our students, staff and partners while facing acute challenges. He expressed concern about the impact of national industrial action being	

undertaken by EIS-FELA on our students, which is compounded by the disruption they faced during the pandemic and now in a cost-of-living crisis. We must be responsive to the changing needs of our students, he said, which is why the College is facilitating staff training to ensure our practices are trauma-informed and providing a sensory space. Referencing a mixed picture of increasing student satisfaction and enrolments together with decreasing attainment, P Little assured the Board that the College would continue efforts to improve the experience and outcomes of City students. The Board welcomed the news that students had recently won the Herald Outstanding Contribution from a College Student Award, a Gold Medal at WorldSkills in Melbourne, the Association of Hairdressers & Therapists Level 5 Barbering Award and Scotland's Student Chef of the Year title.

Decision

To note the report.

Item BoM5-4.5	Impact of Industrial Act	ion on the Student Experience
Paper No: BoM5-I	Lead: C Carney	Action Requested: Discuss
Discussion	C Carney reported to the Board that, at this stage, 38% of the academ year had been lost to local and national industrial action in 2023-24. Streminded members that this disruption is not spread equally across to College but is, instead, concentrated in different areas. Whacknowledging the disruption caused to all students' impact, C Carnemphasised the impact on vulnerable students who are younger and have additional support needs and stressed that the College must conside the cumulative impact on these groups of students. She highlighted to anticipated negative impact on student completion and withdrawal rate this year and acknowledged the difficulties staff and students have fact this year.	
	D Mackeen raised his concern about the loss of provision of supported education access courses and suggested that initiatives, such as a community garden, should be pursued by the College. J Taylor recognised the value of projects like the community garden but stressed that industrial action, specifically the withholding of results — is the major challenge for students that is preventing them from moving into work or further study.	
	and EIS-FELA and hope national dispute, as it overshadowed. They a	r regret that there is a standstill between colleges is that they can work together to resolve the current is feels like the student experience is being leso emphasised the importance of clearly and ing and advising students and ensuring that sures are in place.
	that colleges currently of fair and sustainable fund right of staff to strike, m action had on students a Board to recognise the	mbers acknowledged the challenging environment berate in and expressed regret about the lack of a ing settlement for the sector. While supporting the embers also acknowledged the impact industrial and staff this academic year. A Sullivan asked the effort of all staff in what has been a difficult year is be passed on. Following a discussion, the Board ecord their thanks.
Decision	To discuss the report, re Board's gratitude.	cognise the efforts of all staff and record the

Item BoM5-4.6	Board Development Plan 2023-24 Progress Report	
Paper No: BoM5-J	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Discuss
Discussion	Development Plan 2023-24 f constraints, he said, members email. S McDowall noted track/ongoing with the except and asked for an update. D MUNISON to re-commence a pr	outlining progress in delivering the Board for the Board's consideration. Due to time is would be welcome to provide feedback by that all actions were complete or on the action on trade union nominees McGowan confirmed that he had contacted focess to appoint a trade union nominee and ar would join early in the new academic year.
Decision	To discuss the report.	

Item BoM5-4.7	City Attributes Update	
Paper No: BoM5-K	Lead: A Bell	Action Requested: Note
Discussion	While noting that this presentation would be deferred to the next meeting of the Board, A Sullivan commended the College's staff for their efforts in developing City Attributes and welcomed the plans to implement the initiative.	
Decision		City Attributes would be deferred to the 024 as per the agreement earlier in the

Item BoM5-5.1	Governance Report	
Paper No: BoM5-L	Lead: D McGowan Action Requested: Note	
Discussion	Members noted the Governance Report for the most recent quarter.	
Decision	To note the report.	

Item BoM5-5.2	Board Recruitment and Appointments	
Paper No: BoM5-M	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Note
Discussion	Members noted the report on recent Board recruitment and appointments and welcomed the significant volume of applications, the commendation from the Glasgow Colleges' Regional Board and the progress on gender balance.	
Decision	To note the report.	

Item BoM5-6 Item BoM5-6.1	Reports from Committees Committee Items for Approval	
Item BoM5-6.1.1	St Luke's Lease Agreeme	nt
Paper No: BoM5-N	Lead: R Gardner	Action Requested: Approval
Discussion	R Gardner requested that the Board issue approval to allow the College to serve notice on the lease arrangement for St Luke's accommodation with Phoenix Talent Holdings. D Anderson said this matter had been discussed	

	at the most recent meeting of the Development Committee, where members agreed to recommend it to the Board for final approval. Members were content to approve the recommendation.
Decision	To issue approval for the College to serve notice on the St Luke's Accommodation lease with Phoenix Talent Holdings.

Item BoM5-6.1.2	CitySA Impact Report 2023-24		
Paper No: BoM5-O	Lead: L Subido	Action Requested: Approval	
Discussion	and received an overview from achievements in this academic y development of the student pa securing the LGBT Gold Chart	The Board considered the Students' Association Impact Report for 2023-24 and received an overview from L Subido. They highlighted those key achievements in this academic year included, but were not limited to, the development of the student pantry, progress on income diversification, securing the LGBT Gold Charter and delivering a series of impactful campaigns. Members congratulated the SA on another successful year and approved the report.	
Decision	To approve the CitySA Impact Re	eport 2023-24.	

Item BoM5 6.1.3	Draft Student Mental Health Agreement	
Paper No: BoM5-P	Lead: L Subido	Action Requested: Approval
Discussion	Experience Commit Agreement (SMHA) L Subido explained plan. It was also em	considered by the Learning, Teaching & Student tee, L Subido tabled the Student Mental Health for the Board's consideration. In presenting the paper, that it has moved from a 2-year to a 5-year thematic phasized that the SMHA would be more strategic and ed by annual action plans. The Board approved the
Decision	To approve the Stud	ent Mental Health Agreement 2024-29.

Item BoM5-6.1.4	6.CGI Ltd - Director Nominations	
Paper No: BoM5-Q	Lead: R Gardner	Action Requested: Approval
Discussion	recommended that the Board reappoint D Rae and S Brecken International (CGI) Ltd Board of an annual review taking place in	n, D Anderson left the meeting. R Gardner e-appoint D Anderson and D Baillie and ridge to serve on the City of Glasgow Directors in the next academic year, with n June 2025. Members were content to pointments. D Anderson returned to the
Decision	To approve the reappointment of I of Directors until 31 July 2025.	D Anderson and D Baillie to the CGI Board
	To approve the appointment of D of Directors, effective immediately	Rae and S Breckenridge to the CGI Board y, until 31 July 2025.

Item BoM5-6.2 Item BoM5-6.2.1	Committee Draft Minutes Conveners' Committee – 29 April 2024	
Paper No: BoM5-R	Lead: D Baillie	Action Requested: Note
Discussion	absence, confirmed the minute	at D Baillie was currently on a leave of was an accurate record and advised neeting of the Conveners' Committee was
	Before moving to the next item, C Montgomery asked if the decision on the Principal's remuneration would be brought to the Board for approval. McGowan confirmed that this responsibility was delegated to the Committee under the Terms of Reference, and it was not a matter reserve for the final approval of the Board under the Scheme of Delegation. He all highlighted that it is appropriate for the Committee to discuss this matter privately, without the Principal or staff present. C Montgomery express his concern about changing the Principal's remuneration, terms a conditions and encouraged the Board to reject any changes at this time. McGowan strongly expressed his concern to the Board, stating that it with wholly inappropriate that this matter was being discussed with the Principal and staff members present and advised against further discussion.	
Decision	To note the draft minute.	

Item BoM5-6.2.2	Development Committee	
Paper No: BoM5-S	Lead: D Anderson Action Requested: Note	
Decision	D Anderson highlighted to the Board that the Developmen appointed him Convener following L Hamilton standing do Board earlier this year.	

Item BoM5-6.2.3	People & Culture Committe	e
Paper No: BoM5-T	Lead: A Barron	Action Requested: Note
Decision	To note the draft minute of held on 15 May 2024.	the People & Culture Committee meeting

Item BoM5-6.2.4	Learning Teaching & Student Experience Committee		
Paper No:	Lead: A Sullivan	Action Requested: Note	
BoM5-U			
Decision	To note the draft minut Committee meeting hel	e of the Learning Teaching & Student Experience d on 28 May 2024.	

Item BoM5-6.2.5	Audit & Assurance Cor	nmittee
Paper No: BoM5-V	Lead: P Hilliard	Action Requested: Note
Decision	P Hillard advised the Board that it had not been possible to circulate a draft minute of the Audit & Assurance Committee ahead of this meeting. He advised the members that the Committee approved the reappointment of the internal auditor for a further two years.	
	To note the update.	

Item BoM5-6.2.6	Finance Committee 12 June 2024		
Paper No: BoM5-W	Lead: R Quinn	Action Requested: Note	
Decision	R Quinn also advised members that it had not been possible to circulate a draft minute of the Finance Committee ahead of this meeting. He advised the Board that the Committee reviewed the draft budget, approved by the Board earlier in the meeting, and approved capital expenditure.		
	To note the update.		

Item BoM5-7	Any Other Notified Business		
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: Chair	Action Requested: Note	
Discussion	A Barron and P Little thanked S Patrick, L Subido and J Taylor for to service to the Board as they prepare to step down in the next few weed P Little also paid tribute to A Barron for his 19 years of service to College as a Board member and Chair. D Anderson thanked A Barron his leadership and contribution to the Board.		

Item BoM5-9	Disclosability of Papers		
Paper No: Verbal	Lead: D McGowan	Action Requested: Note	
Decision	The disclosablility status of all papers be retained as tabled.		
Item BoM5-10	Date of Next Meeting		
Decision	The next meeting will be hel	d on Wednesday 2 October 2024.	

The meeting closed at 2000 hours

## **ANNEX TO THE MINUTE**

### **ACTION POINTS ARISING FROM THE MEETING**

Item	Description	Owner	Target Date
BoM5-4.7	City Attributes Update: To agree that a	A Bell	02 10 24
19 06 24	presentation on City Attributes be deferred to		
	the Board's meeting on 2 October 2024.		
BoM5-3.4	Amendments to Committee ToRs: To agree	DM	Prior to
19 06 24	to take a decision by correspondence on minor		02 10 24
	amendments before the Board meeting on 2		
	October 2024.		

### **ACTION POINTS ARISING FROM PREVIOUS MEETINGS**

Item	Description	Owner	Target Date
BoM3-3.3	College Performance Report 22-23: Provide	PL/JG	Date to be
14 12 23	a Power-Bi dashboard demo at a future date.		agreed
BoM3-4.1	SA Update: Consider including class rep	LS/JT	Ongoing
14 12 23	benchmarking information and additional NUS		
	updates in future reports.		
BoM3-6.1.1	CGI Ltd - Director Nominations: Review	Board	BoM Mtg
14 12 23	nominated non-executive directors.		19 06 24
			Complete