

## Board of Management Audit & Assurance Committee

<b>Date of Meeting</b>	<b>Thursday 14 March 2024</b>
<b>Paper No.</b>	<b>AAC3-F</b>
<b>Agenda Item</b>	<b>5.3.1</b>
<b>Subject of Paper</b>	<b>Internal Audit Report – Libraries &amp; Learning Technologies (L&amp;T Academy)</b>
<b>FOISA Status</b>	<b>Disclosable</b>
<b>Primary Contact</b>	<b>Henderson Loggie</b>
<b>Date of production</b>	<b>13 February 2024</b>
<b>Action</b>	<b>For Discussion and Decision</b>

### 1. Recommendations

The Committee is asked to consider and discuss the report and the management responses to the internal audit recommendations.

## 2. Purpose of report

The purpose of this review is to provide management and the Audit and Assurance Committee with assurance on key controls relating to the curriculum and financial plans in place for City of Glasgow College and their alignment with the regional plan for Glasgow and the college student number targets.

## 3. Key Insights

This internal audit of Libraries and Learning Technologies provides an outline of the objectives, scope, findings and graded recommendations as appropriate, together with management responses. This constitutes an action plan for improvement.

The Report includes a number of audit findings which are assessed and graded to denote the overall level of assurance that can be taken from the Report. The gradings are defined as follows:

Good	System meets control objectives.
Satisfactory	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.
Requires improvement	System has weaknesses that could prevent it achieving control objectives.
Unacceptable	System cannot meet control objectives.

## 4. Impact and implications

Refer to internal audit report.

**Appendix – Internal Audit Report – Libraries and Learning Technologies (L&T Academy)**

# City of Glasgow College

## Libraries and Learning Technologies (L&T Academy)

Internal Audit report No: 2024/02

Draft issued: 29 January 2024

Final issued: 13 February 2024



		<b>Page</b>
<b>Section 1</b>	<b>Management Summary</b>	
	• Overall Level of Assurance	1
	• Risk Assessment	1
	• Background	1
	• Scope, Objectives and Overall Findings	2
	• Audit Approach	2
	• Summary of Main Findings	3
	• Acknowledgements	3
 <b>Section 2</b>	 <b>Main Findings and Action Plan</b>	 <b>4 - 9</b>

### Level of Assurance

In addition to the grading of individual recommendations in the action plan, audit findings are assessed and graded on an overall basis to denote the level of assurance that can be taken from the report. Risk and materiality levels are considered in the assessment and grading process as well as the general quality of the procedures in place.

Gradings are defined as follows:

<b>Good</b>	System meets control objectives.
<b>Satisfactory</b>	System meets control objectives with some weaknesses present.
<b>Requires improvement</b>	System has weaknesses that could prevent it achieving control objectives.
<b>Unacceptable</b>	System cannot meet control objectives.

### Action Grades

<b>Priority 1</b>	Fundamental issue subjecting the organisations to material risk which requires to be addressed by management and the Audit and Assurance Committee as a matter of urgency.
<b>Priority 2</b>	Issue subjecting the organisations to significant risk, and which should be addressed by management as a priority.
<b>Priority 3</b>	Matters subjecting the organisations to minor risk or which, if addressed, will enhance efficiency and effectiveness.



## Management Summary

### Overall Level of Assurance

<b>Good</b>	System meets control objectives.
-------------	----------------------------------

### Risk Assessment

This review focused on the controls in place to mitigate the following risks on the City of Glasgow College ('the College') Risk Register (as at December 2023):

- SR1 – Failure to support successful student outcomes and progression (Net Score 20, High);
- SR2 – Failure to establish an optimal pedagogical model (Net Score 5, Low);
- SR9 – Failure to manage performance and achieve improved performance (Net Score 10, Medium); and
- SR24 – Failure to secure sufficient capital investment (Net Score 16, High).

### Background

As part of the Internal Audit programme at the College for 2023/24 we carried out a review of the arrangements in place for managing libraries and learning technologies, within the Learning and Teaching Academy (LTA). The Audit Needs Assessment identified this as an area where risk can arise and where Internal Audit can assist in providing assurances to the Principal and the Audit and Assurance Committee that the related control environment is operating effectively, ensuring risk is maintained at an acceptable level.

The College's LTA is formed of three teams: Learning Technologies; Lecturer Development; and Library Services. Each element brings together expertise to support course instructional design, academic development, learning technology and information science to enhance learning and teaching across the curriculum. The LTA is led by the Vice Principal for Student Experience and the Director for Student Experience.

The Learning Technologies team supports lecturers in the production of learning materials, and in their use of technologies. The team develop, manage, and deliver training programmes to lecturers as well as project manage small scale projects to pilot new resources. The team is led by the Head of Digital Skills.

To further support staff there is a dedicated LTA Portal. Its content provides information on learning and teaching practices, details on the College's Virtual Learning Environment (VLE), Canvas, and other learning technologies, assistive technology for support people with disabilities to improve interaction with online content, library services, digital skills, student support, world-skills, and developing teaching practices.

Library Services comprise of two campus libraries and facilitates access to curriculum aligned collections in both print and digital. Staff and students are automatically registered to use the services and collections. Further information is also available on the College's dedicated Library's Website. The Library Services Team is led by the Libraries Manager.



## Scope, Objectives and Overall Findings

This audit reviewed the learning technologies utilised in all College libraries and classrooms and the use of digital learning tools to enhance the learner experience.

The table below notes each separate objective for this review and records the results:

Objective	Findings				Actions in progress or planned
The objective of our audit was to obtain reasonable assurance that:	1	2	3	No. of Agreed Actions	
	1. The College has exploited the potential of new technology in order to widen access to the curriculum and enhance the learner experience	Good	-	-	1
2. Adequate licensing and copyright arrangements are in place	Good	-	-	-	✓
3. Investment in new learning technologies aligns with curriculum planning	Good	-	-	-	✓
4. Resources are aligned with the needs of both staff and learners as captured through feedback mechanisms	Good	-	-	-	✓
5. Sufficient service desk support is available to maintain access to online learning platforms out of normal College hours	Good	-	-	-	✓
6. There are appropriate monitoring and reporting frameworks in place to ensure that the use and benefits from the investment in learning technologies are as intended	Good	-	-	-	✓
Overall Level of Assurance	Good	-	-	1	
		System meets control objectives.			

## Audit Approach

We assessed whether the above objectives are being met through discussions with key staff, including the Vice Principal of Student Experience, Director of Student Experience, the Library Manager, Head of Digital Skills and Learning Technology, relevant IT staff, student representation from the Student Association, and a sample of Curriculum Heads from across each faculty. We also spoke with the Equalities Manager to understand the considerations made when reviewing accessibility arrangements of learning technologies by staff and students, and how the use of learning technology is assessed in quality reviews with the Director of Excellence.

We also reviewed relevant documentation and reporting on the investment and use of digital learning technologies across the College and the licensing arrangements for Adobe, Canvas, ClickView, Microsoft 365 and Turnitin.



### Summary of Main Findings

#### **Strengths**

- There is strong connection between the LTA, Digital Services, and curriculum areas which is designed to ensure that the teaching and learning technology needs of staff and students are identified and actions are initiated to address any gaps identified;
- There is a framework established by curriculum areas to assess their technology needs via the annual curriculum enhancement and portfolio review processes;
- There is a dedicated LTA Portal in place for staff and students to provide access to information on offerings and support, including helpdesk support;
- The LTA Portal identified the Learning Wheel that allows linkage between learning technology and learning outcomes;
- There is clear division of responsibilities for the management of learning technologies and related licenses are well understood between LTA and Digital Services;
- Where possible, metrics are used to assess the usage of learning technologies, such as within Library services and for the uptake of the College's VLE, Canvas;
- The College surveys staff and students annually. This includes survey using the Jisc Insight Tool allowing the College to benchmark its digital offerings across the UK. Improvement actions are taken forward by the LTA team;
- Acknowledging need for digital inclusion, the College has established a laptop loan scheme whereby students can borrow laptops for a day. A two-day loan scheme is under development. Hardship funds are also established for students who are experiencing issues with digital accessibility. Information on these schemes are available on the Student Portal;
- It was evident that there is a strong culture of continuous improvement in the learning technology offerings, their accessibility, and support provided to staff and students. Improvement actions are taken forward by the LTA teams;
- The class representative (rep) process ensures direct feedback from students to faculties to address immediate issues. Feedback is also sought via Class Reps by the Student Association, and in November 2023 the Class reps provided specific feedback on the use of Canvas;
- There is appropriate management of learning technology licenses;
- The College rolled out a new IT Helpdesk that aligns to good practice. There is planning to link the IT helpdesk with helpdesks established by the LTA teams so to centralise support and reporting; and
- Governance frameworks are established to provide reporting on feedback and utilisation and performance metrics to the Executive Management Team, where appropriate, or Board committee.

#### **Opportunity for Enhancement**

- While guidance for staff and students on the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) is available online, our sample testing of LTA arrangements with Curriculum Heads noted inconsistency in their understanding on the College's stance on its use by students. This could impact the overall conformance of staff and students with the College's advice. There is also absence of a risk associated with the use of AI, Virtual Reality, and Augmented Reality tools on the College's risk register (December 2023) in order to drive discussion on potential threats or opportunities to the College.

### Acknowledgments

We would like to take this opportunity to thank the staff at City of Glasgow College and the Student Association who helped us during the course of our audit.



## Main Findings and Action Plan

### **Objective 1 - The College has exploited the potential of new technology in order to widen access to the curriculum and enhance the learner experience.**

The College's Strategic Plan 2021-2030 sets eight priorities for which Priority 1 is for the College to be an inspirational place of learning. This priority has several aims including to be the industry partner of choice, and foster excellence, digital innovation, and creativity in learning, teaching and assessment. To support the delivery of these aims, the College also has published its Student Academic Experience Strategy 2021-30 and Delivery Plan that is led by the Vice Principal (VP) of Student Experience. This sets out the College's ambitions for the Learning and Teaching Academy (LTA). Discussions with the VP of Student Experience and Director of Student Experience noted delivery of the strategic aims were well underway.

The Student Academic Experience Strategy commits the College to a model of learning and teaching that is active, blended and connected. Learning and library technologies are reviewed by management annually following the staff and student Digital Experience Insights Survey for Learnings – Benchmarking Survey (October 2023) and outcomes from faculty curriculum reviews for the oncoming academic year. Actions tie into annual operating plans, with any related investment identified via the College's annual budget plan.

Management recognise that horizon scanning is critical to ensure the learning technology offerings are current and future fit. Discussions highlighted that the Head of Digital Services and Learning Technology and Libraries Manager each work closely with the College Development Network (CDN) and Jisc network and the College is a member of relevant national and UK associations on learning technology and libraries collections. This ensures all relevant potential opportunities to improve the learners' experience through technology are explored. These networks have also been essential to support management in the roll out of the College's Virtual Learning Environment (VLE), Canvas, that is now embedded across the College. Discussions noted the current focus of management is to improve the learning experiences and bring consistency to those experiences where appropriate.

Similarly, Curriculum Heads highlighted their role in keeping up to date with industry technology norms mainly to ensure that learners have access and develop skills in appropriate, industry-backed technologies. Annually, the College hosts an LTA Conference where technologies are showcased. There is close working between faculties, Skills Development Scotland, and industry to ensure students develop appropriate skills and experiences to improve employability. For example, the College works with industry partners and is a member of the Employers Board hosted by the Career College Trust and Sir Robert McAlpine Ltd where curriculum delivery and digital skills planning for construction students are discussed.

The LTA Portal also lists the learning technology already supported by the College, with related guidance and support. The Learning Wheel is also established to show how specific tools, guidance and support relate to the ABC Learning Model and the College's stance to blended learning. This includes guidance to staff and students on using Artificial Intelligence (AI) and discussions are ongoing to the use and risks associated with Virtual Reality (VR). In relation to AI, the College is taking a pragmatic view to understanding the risks as well as positives AI can have on the learners' experiences. The College has published its stance on the use of AI and academic integrity for students (April 2023) and staff (April 2023). Inspection noted that it aligned to current expected practice.

Management highlighted the importance of ensuring that the College maintains appropriate investment in its digital infrastructure to support the learning experience and maintain its digital capabilities. We noted close working between the LTA and the wider Digital Services team, with the Student Academic Experience Strategy dovetailing into the College's Digital Strategy 2021-30 and the capital investment programme.





## Libraries and Learning Technologies (L&T Academy)

**Objective 1 - The College has exploited the potential of new technology in order to widen access to the curriculum and enhance the learner experience (continued).**

Observation	Risk	Recommendation	Management Response		
<p>While guidance for staff and students on the use of AI is available online, our sample testing of LTA arrangements with Curriculum Heads noted inconsistency in their understanding on the College's stance on its use by students.</p> <p>There is also absence of a risk associated with the use of AI, VR and Augmented Reality (AR) tools on the College's risk register (December 2023) so to engage discussion on potential threats or opportunities to the College.</p>	<p>Transparency to when the use of AI should be disclosed by teaching staff and students for learning and assessment purposes.</p>	<p><b>R1</b> Published advice on the use of AI in learning and teaching should be communicated to all lecturers, for example, at the beginning of each academic session.</p> <p>Emerging issues for the College arising from the threats and opportunities relating to AI, VR, and AR technology should be identified for ongoing management discussion and monitoring.</p>	<p>AI will be included in pre-induction and induction materials. The induction materials for session 23/24 included AI and pre induction materials will be updated in April/May 2024 for the 24/25 session.</p> <p>A new entry will be added to the Strategic Risk Register in the next review and tabled at the Board for final approval in June.</p> <p><b>To be actioned by:</b> Derek Robertson, Director of Student Experience and Drew McGowan, Associate Director of Governance &amp; Risk</p> <p><b>No later than:</b> 30 June 2024</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td><b>Grade</b></td> <td><b>3</b></td> </tr> </table>	<b>Grade</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Grade</b>	<b>3</b>				



## Libraries and Learning Technologies (L&T Academy)

### **Objective 2 - Adequate licensing and copyright arrangements are in place.**

Our sample testing of five technologies identified on the College's Learning Wheel noted there are appropriate arrangements for the management of licences and software agreements. There are clear ownership arrangements ensuring delegated responsibility for maintaining technologies between that LTA and Digital Services. The Digital Services team also has asset libraries that list all software and hardware used across the College and is actively involved in supporting curriculum areas with updates.

In relation to libraries, the College holds:

- The Copyright License Agreement permit (CLA) for Further Education (FE) and Newspaper Licensing Agency (NLA) licenses that allow the use of academic content in teaching and learning, both online and hard copy for staff and students studying FE and Higher Education (HE),
- Educational Recording Agency (ERA) license that allows the use of education video content and broadcast resources in the classroom and online in Canvas, allowing the utilisation of content from ClickView and Box of Broadcasts.
- Public Performance License and the Performing Rights / TheMusicLicense from PPL/PRS is also used in the Gym, Sports Classes, in catering outlets and any theatrical or dramatic events that the College host.

Management also highlighted that they are launching new copyright training for staff and students in January 2024 with the aim to improve awareness on open educational practice and Creative Commons.



### **Objective 3 - Investment in new learning technologies aligns with curriculum planning.**

Learning technology requirements are identified during the annual curriculum enhancement and portfolio review processes that occurred late November 2023 for the 2024/25 academic year and that was previously reviewed by us in our Curriculum Planning Report Number 2021/09, issued November 2021. During this process, the content of the portfolio / course / module is reviewed by Faculty Boards, with business cases that may include learning technology needs ultimately reviewed by the Academic Board. This is underway. The portfolio review process also allows lecturers to explore online / blended learning opportunities.

The main investment by the College was its implementation of its VLE, Canvas. All faculties now use Canvas to host learning material. The LTA team has recognised that while the VLE is available across the College, its use by lecturing staff is inconsistent with some using it more confidently than others. Over 2023/24, the focus for the LTA team will be Lecturer Development that will include the review of training needs for developing Canvas and workshops on learning design.

The Head of Digital Skills and Learning Technology also monitors uptake of Canvas to identify any areas requiring additional support. Usage is reported to the Digital Transformation Group, together with outcomes from the College's Jisc benchmarking survey and My Student Experience Survey. This allows monitoring that new learning technology uptake aligns with student and staff needs.

Management highlighted the need for continuous improvement in the classroom environment as technology changes. Our discussions with the Head of Digital Services noted close working between Digital Services and LTA with formal weekly meetings. This ensures any interdependencies with developments are discussed and actions planned. There is also close working between Digital Services and curriculum areas to ensure technology is appropriate for learning. An example highlighted was their provision of sandpits for software development training by students.

There is also recognition that the campus currently has an ageing digital infrastructure. For example, there is awareness that for the Broadcasting department the network infrastructure does not support their production workflow needs. The Curriculum Head for Broadcasting has submitted a capital bid for a new media server for their post-production workflows. Any updates are prioritised through the capital investment programme (previously reviewed in our Capital Projects Report Number 2021/08, issued November 2021). Where possible, external investment is also sourced. For example, there was investment in three active learning classrooms where management worked with industry partners, such as Intel and Fujitsu, to secure additional resources. These active learning spaces allow teaching staff to offer hybrid learning experience when students need these.

Digital inclusion also remains a priority to the College. Considering post-pandemic funding cuts, the College has changed its stance on digital device provision to students and has developed a short-term laptop loan process that is managed by Library Services. There is also Hardship Funding available for students who are struggling with accessing devices and connectivity. Arrangements on hardship funding arrangements was reviewed by us in our Business Process Review (BPR) Student Funding Report Number 2023/12, issued November 2023. Management interviewed noted work is continuous on improving communications on device accessibility and funding to students, with information available to students on Canvas and on the College's public website.



### **Objective 4 - Resources are aligned with the needs of both staff and learners as captured through feedback mechanisms.**

Students, teaching staff and support staff are surveyed annually using the Jisc Insights Tool that benchmarks the LTA offering with colleges from across the UK. Management highlighted that for 2022/23 the College scored strongly across the survey (October 2023) with an action plan established where scores were at lower ratings. For example, difficulties with remote access and mobile data costs and inconsistency in the quality of information on Canvas by lecturing staff. These actions are being taken forward by the LTA.

Feedback is also obtained directly by faculties via the “Closing the Loops” Class Reps process and there are annual College quality surveys and LTA Helpdesk information. In November 2023, there was Canvas specific Class Rep feedback obtained from across the College. Our discussions with representation from the Student Association noted close working between the Student Association and the LTA when obtaining and reviewing student feedback. If there are higher level issues, these are reported via the Presidential Team within the College’s governance framework.

There are longer term ambitions of the Director of Excellence and Head of Digital Skills to review the impact of investment in technology on the learning and teaching experiences through benefit realisation planning and outcome monitoring. However, planning is in its infancy and will be reliant on resource.

Digital accessibility is also a priority to the College, and we noted an array of initiatives are established by Library Services and wider LTA team. Occupational Health support staff in technology support needs. There is also strong linkage between the LTA, Faculty and Student Support services for supporting learner needs. In relation to learning technology, there are frequent audits performed on resources, such as on the College’s website and staff / student portals, to ensure Web Content Accessibility Guidelines (WCAG) 2.1 partial compliance (note that the Accessibility and Equality Statement, February 2023, discloses areas of non-compliance). Our discussions with management across the Equalities, LTA and curriculum areas sample tested noted consistency in the accessibility offerings to students, such as Recite Me or Immersion Reader.

The College also has an Equality Impact Assessment (EqIA) for Learning and Teaching that ensures risks associated with staff / student surveys, reasonable adjustments and inclusion needs have been assessed against protected characteristics.



## Libraries and Learning Technologies (L&T Academy)

### **Objective 5 - Sufficient service desk support is available to maintain access to online learning platforms out of normal College hours.**

Library Services run an email-based helpdesk for students and staff, only during College hours. The Library team has a FAQ knowledge page and is exploring the potential of a chat / autobot service for general enquiries for out with office hours.

We noted that Canvas is cloud-based with access to content 24/7. However, if there were issues on any learning technologies, the LT team also has an e-mail-based helpdesk for students and staff during College hours. All digital databases have a 3-minute video held on Canvas that takes a student through basic information.

The College rolled out its IT Helpdesk, 4Me, in November 2023. Our walkthrough of arrangements noted it aligns to expected practice and activity was underway to refine monitoring and reporting arrangements, such as revised key performance indicators, that will support monitoring customer satisfaction, red flag reporting and any related continuous improvement. Discussions were also underway to explore whether the LTA service can also utilise the new IT helpdesk so to create a converged and central point for all helpdesk activity for all departments.

### **Objective 6 - There are appropriate monitoring and reporting frameworks in place to ensure that the use and benefits from the investment in learning technologies are as intended.**

Performance measures are in place to qualify and quantify library service activities and to support the continued development of student focused content and guidance. As noted in **Objective 3**, there are plans in place to establish processes to measure the impact of investment in learning technologies in staff and student retention and outcomes. However, planning is in the very early stages.

Library Services work to Customer Service Experience (CSE) standards where performance is annually assessed. Monthly data usage on a range of library support interactions (online and face to face) and content usage (online and on site) allows management to compare usage with previous year and change of support interaction.

As detailed earlier, the LT team monitors closely the use and uptake of Canvas and associated tools. Data is reported to the Digital Transformation Group. The LTA also monitors help desk queries and workshop bookings on a quarterly basis so to tailor offerings based on needs and requests.

Outputs from the Jisc benchmarking survey and staff / student surveys are also reported to the Student Academic Experience Committee. The usage of Canvas is also regularly discussed by the Head of Digital Skills and Learning Technology with the Head of Digital Services, Director of Student Experience, and the College Principal.



---

**Aberdeen** 45 Queen's Road AB15 4ZN

**Dundee** The Vision Building, 20 Greenmarket DD1 4QB

**Edinburgh** Ground Floor, 11-15 Thistle Street EH2 1DF

**Glasgow** 100 West George Street, G2 1PP

**T:** 01224 322 100

**T:** 01382 200 055

**T:** 0131 226 0200

**T:** 0141 471 9870

**F:** 01224 327 911

**F:** 01382 221 240

**F:** 0131 220 3269

Henderson Loggie LLP is a limited liability partnership registered in Scotland with registered number SO301630 and is a member of PrimeGlobal, a global association of independent accounting firms, the members of which are separate and independent legal entities. Registered office is: The Vision Building, 20 Greenmarket, Dundee, DD1 4QB. All correspondence signed by an individual is signed for and on behalf of Henderson Loggie LLP. Reference to a 'partner' is to a member of Henderson Loggie LLP. A list of members' names is available for inspection at each of these addresses.

